



***Innovative Approaches to educating health  
managers: some practice questions and  
challenges***

Peter Carswell  
University of Auckland

Anne Smyth  
Organisational Consulting



## To consider . . .

- Would you go to a surgeon if he/she didn't know the latest evidence and practice for effective surgical intervention?
- Would you go to a hospital run by a manager that didn't know and apply the best evidence for effective and efficient running of the hospital?
- In the first case the surgeon has direct control over application of their knowledge. The health manager does not.

## The 2 challenges for SHAPE



- Ensuring managers have knowledge of the best evidence for effective and efficient running of hospitals and health services
- Helping managers translate that knowledge into practice.
  
- Is SHAPE concerned with one or both??
  - Consider the roles of other professional colleges in getting practice change to occur

# Translation and application



- Approaches for Individual learning about translation
- Approaches for organisational learning about application

## Theories and models to support learning translation

Theories	Current teaching approaches	Evidence for translation
Behaviourism (e.g. skinner)	Content based lectures and short answer tests	Poor
Cognitivism (e.g. Bandura)	Lecturer directed content lectures and essay type assessment	Poor
Developmental theories (Piaget, Erikson)	Coaching, self-directed learning	Moderate
Activity theory (e.g. Vygotsky)	Peer based in work projects	Moderate - Good
Situated cognition (e.g. Lave, Wenger)	Reflection and coaching while engaging in actual work practice	Moderate - Good

# Supporting application and sustainability of change



## Theories and models to support sustained application of learning

Theories of organisational learning	Current teaching approaches	Evidence for sustained application
4I theory: Intuition, Interpretation, Implementation, Institutionalisation(Crossan)	????	good but limited
OLMs: Organistaional Learning Mechanisms (Popper)	???	good but limited
SECI: Socialisation, Externalisation, Combination, Integration (Nonaka)	???	Moderate
Shared mental models cycle (Kim)	???	Moderate - Good

# Where are SHAPE member programs??



Approaches to support learning translation (individual learning)		Approaches to support application and sustainability of learning (organisational learning)	
Model	% of current delivery	Model	% of current delivery
Content based lectures and short answer tests		Models that support the process of organisational learning	
Lecturer directed content lectures and essay type assessment			
Coaching, self-directed learning			
Peer based in work projects			
Reflection and coaching while engaging in actual work practice			



## What if we framed it differently?

- Is it an issue of learning transfer/translation or that one of taking a fundamentally different stance?
- What if we consider how we:
  - Ensure managers & educators are able to access each others 'knowledge' & through robust, mutual enquiry, articulate the best evidence for running health services
  - Help managers use theory & research to enquire into their individual & collective experience
  - Help educators enquire into the value of their theory and research by drawing on the experience of managing & leading health services
- Is SHAPE interested in this and what would it mean for how programs are designed & delivered, by whom and where?



## The issue of translation

- Often binary and linear – provokes either/or choices, splitting and fragmentation
- Oversimplifies the complexity of the task of application
- Assumes and reinforces particular authority relations which privilege academic and practice knowledge hierarchically
- Precludes consideration of real change and innovation eg re-locating the delivery of programs

## What works?



- A flexible overarching framework that respects and enables an integrated stance
- Does not preclude the use of a broad range of interventions, tools & methods
- Proper curriculum design – not the smorgasbord but a developmental process based on clear learning principles
- Educators with the capacity to judge what combination of interventions & tools are needed when
- Managers willing to help shape all of the above rather than just complain about lack of relevance
- Willingness to draw upon a range of inputs – academic, practitioner, internal, external to the industry etc

## We need dialogue



- And we (educators and managers) need to look up and out
- Who else should be engaged in this discussion?
- Who else should be invited to shape the 'problem', the 'debate', the 'questions'?
- How might we start the dialogue?
- Next steps?